[Fwd: Your Submission]

Heru Setyawan
ke NANIK_AR29@YAHOO.COM
24/2/2015 16.12

Assalamu 'alaikum wr wb

Bu Nanik, berikut hasil review paper yang dikirim ke Colloids and Surfaces
A. Tolong dipelajari dan disiapkan yang diperlukan.

Saya lampirkan versi terakhir dan pdfnya.

Heru

---------- Original Message ----------
Subject: Your Submission
From: "Colloids & Surfaces A" <colsua@elsevier.com>
Date: Mon, February 23, 2015 3:55 pm
To: sheru@chem-eng.its.ac.id

Ms. Ref. No.: COLSUA-D-14-01840
Title: Synthesis of mesoporous silica with controlled pore structure from
bagasse ash as a silica source
Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects

Dear Prof. Heru Setyawan,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper. You will see that they are
advising that you revise your manuscript. If you are prepared to undertake
the work required, I would be pleased to consider your revision.

[Fwd: Your Submission]

On your Main Menu page is a folder entitled 'Submissions Needing Revision". You will find your submission record there.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please ensure that you upload the source files (e.g. Word). Uploading a PDF file at this stage will create delays should your manuscript be finally accepted for publication. If your revised submission does not include the source files, we will contact you to request them.

Please note that this journal offers a new, free service called AudioSlides: brief, webcast-style presentations that are shown next to published articles on ScienceDirect (see also http://www.elsevier.com/audioslides). If your paper is accepted for publication, you will automatically receive an invitation to create an AudioSlides presentation.

Yours sincerely,

Junbai Li, Dr.
Editor
Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects

Reviewers' comments:

[Fwd: Your Submission]

-An entire characterization (TEM) of bagasse (without treatment) must be
included in the manuscript, in order to know the effect of PEG, and other
processess.

- Add few more relevant references: Yang, Y., Adv Colloid Interface Sci.,
207(2014)155-163; Chem. Asian J., 9(2014)2126-2131; Chem. Commun., 47
(2011) 12167-12169.

In the present shape this manuscript is not appropriate for publication in
Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects,
significat improvemnts must be done.

****

[Fwd: Your Submission]

Overall, I believe this paper will be of interest to the readers of
Colloids and Surfaces A, therefore I would recommend its publication after
revision.

Reviewer #2: In reference to the manuscript with title: Synthesis of
mesoporous silica with controlled pore structure from bagasse ash as a
silica source, my comments and suggestions are the following:

-SEM images are of poor resolution and do not provide evidence of
formation of mosoporosity, then, I suggest to remove these images or
include in suplementary material.

-TEM must be used as a characterization technique, a pore size of 18 nm in
this material (as written by authors) can be easily observed by standard
TEM.

-Nitrogen adsorption-desorption isotherms is an indirect technique used to
measure surface area (and pore size), TEM images are more valuable, this
is because the authors reported surface area values too high like 525 and
656 m2/g, which in my opinion are too large for a pore size of 18 nm, in
my opinion one of these values is apparently wrong.

[Fwd: Your Submission]

Reviewer #1: The manuscript by Heru Setyawan and co-workers describes the
synthesis of mesoporous silica from bagasse ash. The idea to use a
renewable resource for silica materials is interesting. The goal of this
work is to build mesoporous silica with controlled pore structure. The
material synthesis and BET characterization seem sound.
The manuscript is well written, well referenced and clearly organized.
The conclusion in 3.2 that PEG is completely removed from the silica after
Soxhlet-extraction is in my opinion not correct, because in the IR
spectrum of PEG-free silica the peak at 2929 cm-1 also exists as in the
spectrum of PEG-silica hybrid. One cannot say that the PEG is completely
removed from the silica. I would suggest rerunning the Soxhlet-extraction
and IR recording or the use other methods, e.g. TGA, to clarify the
conclusion.
The quality of the SEM image in Fig 5a is not good. I would recommend the
authors to use a better one to see the difference between 5a and 5b, also
the scale in Fig. 5a is missing.
The authors wrote in the text of Fig 1 "â€¦ threshold of the boundary
curve occurring at p/p0 of approximately 0.42. â€¦", but in Fig 1 the
threshold is around at 0.5. Please clarify this point.
In Fig 2c the Numbers are in arabic not in roman as in the other figures.

revision.

For your guidance, reviewers' comments are appended below.

If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a
rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the
revised manuscript.

Please submit your revised manuscript in 21 days. If you need more time to
complete the revisions, please let me know.

To submit a revision, please go to http://ees.elsevier.com/colsua/ and
login as an Author.
Your username is: sheru@chem-eng.its.ac.id
If you need to retrieve password details, please go to:
http://ees.elsevier.com/colsua/automail_query.asp

On your Main Menu page is a folder entitled "Submissions Needing
Revision". You will find your submission record there.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please ensure that you upload the
source files (e.g. Word). Uploading a PDF file at this stage will create
delays should your manuscript be finally accepted for publication. If your
revised submission does not include the source files, we will contact you
to request them.

Please note that this journal offers a new, free service called

[Fwd: Your Submission]

significat improvemnts must be done.

****

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at
http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923. Here you can search for
solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions
and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our
24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from
one of our customer support representatives.

--
Department of Chemical Engineering
Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember
Kampus ITS Sukolilo, Surabaya 60111, Indonesia
http://elkimkor.com/

Institut Teknologi Sepuluh Nopember (ITS)
http://www.its.ac.id

COLSU...6.pdf

Nanik...t.docx